

NATIONAL CLIMATE ASSESSMENT AND DEVELOPMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE
MEETING MINUTES
FRIDAY, JANUARY 11, 2013
TELEPHONE MEETING, 11AM – 1PM EST

WELCOME AND OVERVIEW OF THE AGENDA, GOALS FOR THE MEETING

Dr. Jerry Melillo, Marine Biological Laboratory and NCADAC Chair

Jerry Melillo welcomed the NCADAC and thanked the members of the NCADAC, chapter authors, NCA staff in Asheville and DC. Dr. Melillo reminded the group that the NCADAC's January 10, 2013 Draft Third NCA Report under discussion at the meeting is a product of the federal advisory committee (NCADAC), and not a report of the federal government. The scheduled public comment period for the NCADAC's Draft Third NCA Report is January 14, 2013 through April 12, 2013.

Decision

Dr. Melillo requested and received approval for Ms. Kathy Jacobs, NCA Director, and Dr. Anne Waple, the NOAA Technical Support Unit Manager, to freely participate in the discussions.

CONSENSUS DISCUSSION AND DECISION ON RELEASE OF DRAFT NCA REPORT FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

Dr. Jerry Melillo, Marine Biological Laboratory and NCADAC Chair
Ms. Kathy Jacobs, Office of Science and Technology Policy and National Climate Assessment Director

Jerry Melillo restated that the NCADAC's Draft Third NCA Report under discussion is a product of NCADAC, and not a government document. The draft report will go through several more rounds of review before the NCADAC approves a final version for submission to the government.

Dr. Melillo described the review and revisions that the draft has undergone in the past few months. Since the first full draft was completed on July 27, 2012, there have been numerous revisions and four rounds of formal NCADAC review. Comments received from NCADAC members (over 2000 comments) were reviewed and considered by chapter authors, with many leading to revisions that changed the draft. A Report Integration Team of NCADAC members also reviewed the entire report for potential inconsistencies and suggested solutions. All the changes that were made in the chapters during revisions were made with the involvement of the chapter authors. Coordinating Lead Authors for each chapter approved the changes that were made in each step of revision.

Over the course of revision rounds, authors and NCADAC members spent a significant amount of time and energy crafting a clear statement on the complex issue of sea level rise. The executive summary also underwent quite a bit of iteration. The Report Integration Team also spent a significant effort to improve cross-references across the chapters and combed through the key messages for issues of consistency.

FINAL

Since the draft of December 20, 2012, a few comments were submitted that were considered to be major. The Mitigation chapter had the most new changes. The Mitigation chapter authors added a paragraph describing the logic of the chapter, made a number of clarifications to wording, and added examples to some of the tables listing major mitigation activities underway.

Cynthia Decker confirmed the presence of a quorum for a NCADAC consensus decision on release of the draft for public comment.

Discussion

Jerry Melillo opened the consensus discussion by asking if there were any comments that would cause a NCADAC member to not be able to support a decision to release for public comment the NCADAC's Draft Third NCA Report that had been uploaded for NCADAC member review on January 10, 2013. Several clarifications were requested on the upcoming process for the production of the report: Kathy Jacobs, Jerry Melillo, and Anne Waple confirmed that (1) the draft will be revised in response to comments in several rounds of review, including review by a panel of the National Academy of Sciences; (2) the NOAA climate and sea level scenarios documents are final and will not be revised (scenarios.globalchange.gov); (3) the version of the draft to be posted for the public review during the comment period would be the same as that approved by NCADAC today, but the PDFs will not have red markings; (4) traceable accounts have been recently reviewed; and (5) that the public comment system will be available through ncadac.globalchange.gov. Pending NCADAC consensus, the draft would be available as of 4pm EST on 11 January 2013 on ncadac.globalchange.gov, and the public comment system would open at 9am EST on Monday, January 14, 2013.

Decision

The NCADAC approved by consensus the release of the NCADAC's Draft Third NCA Report for public comment.

TIMELINE

Ms. Kathy Jacobs, Office of Science and Technology Policy and National Climate Assessment Director

Kathy Jacobs reviewed the timeline for finalization of the Third NCA Report. The timeline was approved by NCADAC at the November 2012 meeting. The description of the process for agency review and finalization has since been revised for clarity. As with previous NCA reports, the process will result in a single report, produced by NCADAC and reviewed by agencies, that meets the requirements of the law. The clarifications concern the process after October 7, 2013, on which date NCADAC will submit the completed report to the National Science and Technology Council (NSTC). NSTC will then confirm that proper Federal Advisory Committee Act (FACA) and Information Quality Act (IQA) procedures have been followed and submit the report to the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) to lead a 2-month interagency review. On December 20, 2013, the Subcommittee on Global Change Research (SGCR) Principals will begin coordinating responses to comments received through interagency review and preparation of a final draft. NSTC will approve the final content on January 30, 2014, and the final public version will be available in March 2014.

Discussion

There was discussion about the point at which the NCADAC's Draft Third NCA Report becomes a government report. The NCADAC will submit its report to the government on October 7, 2013. The

government is not bound to accept the NCADAC's report as it is submitted. During the subsequent interagency review period, it is expected that there will be an iterative process between the agencies and authors. A similar iterative, collegial process was successfully applied in the interagency review of the two previous NCA reports. Agencies have already provided comments through Ex-Officio NCADAC members through the development of the draft, and are invited to submit comments during the public comment period.

COMMUNICATIONS AND ENGAGEMENT DURING THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

Ms. Kathy Jacobs, Office of Science and Technology Policy and National Climate Assessment Director

Kathy Jacobs reviewed guidelines for discussion of the NCADAC's Draft Third NCA Report. The most important points were summarized. The draft is a product of the NCADAC and should not be attributed to the government. NCADAC and authors may explain what is in the report but should not defend the contents or argue about them. NCADAC and authors are free to speak in areas of their expertise, but should not speak for the whole committee or other authors. The online comment system, available at ncadac.globalchange.gov, is the only way to submit comments. It is not permissible for individuals to submit comments on behalf of others or through NCA staff. Media requests, links to published interviews or articles, and erroneous statements about the draft should be reported to Emily Cloyd and Glynis Lough. Finally, because NCADAC is under the auspices of NOAA, Brady Phillips of NOAA (brady.phillips@noaa.gov) is available to help with any media questions.

REVIEW EDITOR SELECTION

Ms. Kathy Jacobs, Office of Science and Technology Policy and National Climate Assessment Director

Kathy Jacobs described the process for selection of Review Editors. The Review Editors will review the responses to comments submitted during the public comment period. Review Editors will be individuals who have not had direct involvement in the NCA process to date, to eliminate the potential for appearance of conflict of interest. Nominations were requested through the National Academies, several professional societies, and a Federal Register Notice (FRN) published in December. The closing date for nominations through the FRN was January 11, 2013. The nominations will be compiled and shared with the Co-Chairs, who will share a set of initial recommendations with the Executive Secretariat (ES). The planned schedule is for the initial list to be shared with the ES on January 30, 2013. Nominations are expected to be discussed with the ES in February, after which staff will begin contacting finalists. The final list is expected to be shared March 13, 2013 with the ES and NCADAC. This timeline will give Review Editors a few months to become familiar with the draft and process before their review of responses between June 8 and July 7, 2013.

Discussion

It was suggested that Review Editors be recused from reviewing responses to any comments they might have made on their assigned chapter. A few additional Review Editors could be selected to review responses to comments submitted by chapter Review Editors.

FINAL

Decision

The NCADAC approved by consensus that Review Editors will be recused from review of their own comments. Additional Review Editors will be appointed to review responses to those comments. This decision will be added as an amendment to the terms of reference for the Review Editors approved by NCADAC in August 2012.

UPDATE ON SPECIAL REPORTS

Ms. Kathy Jacobs, Office of Science and Technology Policy and National Climate Assessment Director

Kathy Jacobs described investments in future assessments that are already being made. Work is underway for development of both foundational documents (related to how assessments are conducted) and topical reports related to specific topics. The result of this work will be a set of interim reports that are released between the quadrennial synthesis reports.

A special report on the sustained assessment process itself, as approved by NCADAC, is already fully underway. The team of three convening lead authors and six lead authors has been meeting weekly and has developed an outline for the report. The team will have a draft by April 1, 2013 for NCADAC review, and will iterate with NCADAC to produce a final version in September 2013. The product will be a NCADAC report to provide advice to the government, and will not go through the additional agency review used for the quadrennial synthesis reports.

Other topics have working groups, but NCADAC has not yet gone through an extensive discussion to formally approve development of other reports. Progress has been made on the topic of food security, and initial scoping has been conducted for a report on the international context of the NCA. After development of approved reports, they will be submitted to NCADAC for adoption by consensus.

NCADAC CHARTER

Dr. Cynthia Decker, NOAA, Designated Federal Official

Cynthia Decker stated that the original two-year NCADAC Charter would expire on January 11, 2013. NOAA had worked with GSA to renew the Charter, and expected that the Charter would be signed before the expiration so that there would be no interruption to NCADAC business.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

Dr. Kandis Wyatt, NOAA NESDIS, Designated Federal Official (Alternate)

No one requested to make a comment. The public comment period was closed and the meeting continued.

CLOSING AND SCHEDULE OF UPCOMING MEETINGS

Dr. Jerry Melillo, Marine Biological Laboratory and NCADAC Chair

Dr. Anne Waple, NOAA National Climatic Data Center

Anne Waple reviewed a potential timeline for NCADAC meetings through the release of the final report, with each possible meeting tied to a milestone in report development. The potential timeline includes a NCADAC teleconference in early May 2013 to review submitted comments and the plan to address them; an in-person meeting in late July to review responses and revisions; an in-person meeting in late September 2013 before delivering the report to the government, a teleconference in December 2013 after interagency review, and an in-person meeting in late February 2014 before release of the final Third NCA Report. Additional teleconferences can be added as needed, with sufficient time to publish a Federal Register notice 15 days in advance. Planning polls will be sent soon for the meeting in early May 2013.

Discussion

There was discussion that the 50-page Summary document fits into the timeline as part of the overall process, and will be submitted by NCADAC to the government with the full report on October 7, 2013.

If NCADAC members would like to submit comments during the public comment period, they should be submitted through the online comment system. The online system will allow us to ensure that we capture all comments and organize them promptly.

Thanks were given to Jerry Melillo, Kathy Jacobs, NCADAC members, authors, and all staff in DC and Asheville for successful delivery of a draft report for public comment.

The meeting was adjourned at 1:03 PM.

APPENDIX A: ATTENDEES

Non-Federal NCADAC Members in attendance

Name	Affiliation
Daniel Abbasi	GameChange Capital, LLC
Ginger Armbrust	University of Washington
Bull Bennett	Kiksapa Consulting
Rosina Bierbaum	PCAST, University of Michigan
James Buizer	University of Arizona
Lynne Carter	Louisiana State University
F. Stuart (Terry) Chapin	University of Alaska
Camille Coley	Florida Atlantic University
Jan Dell	CH2MHill
Paul Fleming	Seattle Public Utilities
Guido Franco	California Energy Commission
Mary Gade	Gade Consulting
Aris Georgakakos	Georgia Institute of Technology
David Gustafson	Monsanto Company
David Hales	Second Nature
Sharon Hays	Computer Sciences Corporation
Mark Howden	CSIRO (Australia)
Tony Janetos	University of Maryland, Pacific Northwest Laboratory
Rattan Lal	Ohio State University
Arthur Lee	Chevron Corporation
Jo-Ann Leong	University of Hawaii
Diana Liverman	University of Arizona
Ed Maibach	George Mason University
Michael McGeehin	RTI International
Jerry Melillo	Marine Biological Laboratory
Susanne Moser	Susanne Moser Research & Consulting
Richard Moss	University of Maryland, Pacific Northwest Laboratory
Phil Mote	Oregon State University
Jayantha Obeysekera	South Florida Water Management District
Lindene Patton	Zurich Financial Services
John Posey	East-West Gateway Council of Governments
Sara Pryor	Indiana University
Terese (T.C.) Richmond	Van Ness Feldman
Andrew Rosenberg	UNH and Union of Concerned Scientists
Richard Schmalensee	Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Henry (Gerry) Schwartz	HGS Consultants, LLC
Joel Smith	Stratus Consulting
Gary Yohe	Wesleyan University

Federal NCADAC Ex-Officio Members in attendance

Name	Affiliation
Ko Barrett	NOAA
Virginia Burkett	U.S. Department of the Interior
John Hall	Department of Defense
Alice Hill	U.S. Department of Homeland Security
Len Hirsch	Smithsonian Institute
Pat Jacobberger-Jellison	NASA
Susan Julius	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Thomas Karl	NOAA/Subcommittee on Global Change Research
George Luber	U.S. Department of Health and Human Services
Andy Miller	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
David Riedmiller	Department of State
Ann Marie Pippin	White House Council on Environmental Quality, for Ruffo
Arthur Rypinski	U.S. Department of Transportation

USGCRP, NOAA, and NCA Staff in attendance

Name	Affiliation
Susan Aragon-Long	USGCRP (USGS)
Emily Cloyd	USGCRP
Cynthia Decker	NOAA
Alison Delgado	USGCRP (JGCRI)
Bryce Golden-Chen	USGCRP
Kathy Jacobs	USGCRP (OSTP)
Melissa Kenney	USGCRP (NOAA)
Ken Kunkel	NOAA
Fred Lipschultz	USGCRP (NASA)
Glynis Lough	USGCRP
Brady Phillips	NOAA
Anne Waple	NOAA
Kandis Wyatt	NOAA

Other attendees

Name	Affiliation
Todd Bianco	Office of Senator Sheldon Whitehouse
Juanita Constible	Climate Reality Project
Stephanie Damassa	Climate Nexus
Mark Drajem	Bloomberg
Juliette Eilperin	Washington Post
Avery Fellow	Bloomberg BNA
Lisa Fleisher	Johns Hopkins School of Public Health
Becky Fried	OSTP
Suzanne Goldenberg	The Guardian
Eric Golman	University of Maryland
Susan Hassol	Climate Communication
Lauren Morello	Climate Wire
Avery Palmer	Climate Reality Project
Elizabeth Perera	Sierra Club
Rick Piltz	Climate Science Watch
Andrew Restuccia	Politico
Amanda Staudt	National Wildlife Federation
Nick Sundt	World Wildlife Fund
Forbes Tompkins	World Resources Institute